This interpretation is certainly preferable to that of Ernout: 3 "l'interjection sert à clore l'énumération." A masterpiece of unhelpfulness, and not even strictly true, since Habinnas' recital continues into the next two sentences. Nor were we much helped by Sedgwick, 4 who absolved himself from the need to comment by expurgating the passage.

At the other end of the scale, Crum⁵ took the phrase to allude to Nero: Palamedes was a son of Nauplius, and the latter was once the theme of a Nero recital. This notion, scouted by Rose,⁶ is not impossible (very little is, when it comes to Nero-hunting in the *Satyricon*⁷), but neither does it attract, since the context of *pax Palamedes* hardly suggests a recognizable allusion to the emperor.

Between the meaningless and the significant, more attractive than both, is the explanation of Sullivan.⁸ He connects the phrase to the story of Palamedes' death at the hands of Ulysses: pax Palamedes reflects Ulysses' happy exclamation when the deed was done.

That is almost right. For catillum concacatum (if this is what Petronius wrote⁹) does not sound very appetizing and well merits an adverse comment. Yet it might be objected that catillum concacatum was a slang expression for some familiar or trendy dish, with

- 3. In his Budé edition (Paris, 1922), ad loc.
- 4. In his second "edition" of the Cena (Oxford, 1950).
- 5. R. H. Crum, "Petronius and the Emperors," CW, XLV (1952), 161 f.
- 6. K. F. C. Rose, The Date and Author of the Satyricon (Leyden, 1971), pp. 84-85.
- 7. Rose, pp. 82-86, registers about ninety supposed allusions.
- 8. J. P. Sullivan, in his Penguin translation (Baltimore, 1965), p. 191, n. 53. He translates the phrase, "good riddance to that." W. Arrowsmith rendered it, "but enough's enough" in his Mentor version (New York, 1959), p. 72.
- 9. Concacatum is really Burman's improvement on the concagatum of H. His adducing of the Greek δυθύλευσις is

no pejorative connotation. And Habinnas' recollection of his meal is a happy one; he does not seem to be wishing its creator dead.

There is another possibility. In Aristophanes Ranae 1451, Dionysus greets Euripides' suggestions on Athenian policy with the sardonic words, $\epsilon \tilde{v}$ γ' $\tilde{\omega}$ $\Pi \alpha \lambda \dot{\alpha} \mu \eta \delta \epsilon s$, $\tilde{\omega}$ $\sigma o \phi \omega \tau \dot{\alpha} \tau \eta$ $\phi \dot{\nu} \sigma \iota s$. The stress is on Palamedes the inventor. This suits the Satyricon perfectly, with its plethora of novel comestibles. One also recollects that there was a story which had Palamedes relieve a famine in the Greek fleet at Aulis. Hence the phrase suits Habinnas, whether he is praising or deploring the catillum concacatum.

Pax Palamedes might be a Romanized version of Aristophanes' interjection. Either, or both, may have been proverbial. And pax is really the Greek $\pi \alpha \xi$. Which is convenient to the argument, for (fortuitously or otherwise) extant examples of $\pi \alpha \xi$ occur in contexts of food. Also, Palamedes the inventor was utilized by Eupolis 12 in a joke concerning the invention of chamber pots by Alcibiades. This detail would enhance the theory of Averil Cameron 13 that Habinnas' entry is a conscious parody of Alcibiades' epiphany in the Symposium of Plato.

BARRY BALDWIN

University of Calgary

pertinent both to the text and to my argument in the latter part of this paper. G. Bagnani, Arbiter of Elegance (Toronto, 1954), p. 80, compared concacatum to omnia concacavit in Seneca(?) Ludus 4. 3—an irrelevance.

- 10. See, e.g., the scholiast on Eur. Or. 432.
- 11. Earlier editions of Liddell & Scott cited only Diphilus from Ath. 2. 67D; the Supplement (Oxford, 1968) added Anth. Pal. 5. 181 (Asclepiades). In both passages, $\pi \alpha \xi$ is countered by $\tau \ell \pi \alpha \xi$.
- 12. Frag. 351 (Edmonds, Frag. Att. Com., I [Leyden, 1957], 430).
- 13. "Petronius and Plato," CQ, LXIII (1969), 367 f. See also P. G. Walsh, The Roman Novel (Cambridge, 1970), p. 40.

AN AUTHOR'S REPLY: LEVIN TO MESSING

Professor Gordon Messing's review of my book, *The Indo-European and Semitic Languages*, in *CP*, LXVIII (1973), 301, was unfortunately based on an advance copy

with a defective title page, omitting the explanatory subtitle, An Exploration of Structural Similarities Related to Accent, Chiefly in Greek, Sanskrit, and Hebrew. As

soon as I discovered the omission in the design of the title page, the publisher agreed to print up little stickers with the subtitle, and to mail one to each reviewing journal that had received an advance copy. But not every sticker reached its destination.

At least one of Professor Messing's

objections to the book could have been forestalled, had he been aware of the subtitle and understood my intention accordingly.

SAUL LEVIN

STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK AT BINGHAMTON